

THE
JESUIT
AND THE
INCAS

*History, Languages, and Cultures of the
Spanish and Portuguese Worlds*

*This interdisciplinary series promotes scholarship
in studies on Iberian cultures and contacts from the premodern
and early modern periods.*

SERIES EDITOR

Sabine MacCormack, University of Michigan

SERIES BOARD

J. N. Hillgarth, emeritus, Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies

Peggy K. Liss, Independent Scholar

David Nirenberg, Rice University

Adeline Rucquoi, École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales

TITLES IN THE SERIES

The Mirror of Spain, 1500–1700: The Formation of a Myth

J. N. Hillgarth

Bishops, Councils, and Consensus in the Visigothic Kingdom, 589–633

Rachel L. Stocking

*Toasts with the Inca: Andean Abstraction and Colonial Images
on Quero Vessels*

Thomas B. F. Cummins

*A Network of Converso Families in Early Modern Toledo:
Assimilating a Minority*

Linda Martz

*Romans in a New World: Classical Models in
Sixteenth-Century Spanish America*

David A. Lupher

*The Jesuit and the Incas: The Extraordinary Life of
Padre Blas Valera, S.J.*

Sabine Hyland



THE
JESUIT
 AND THE
INCAS

*The Extraordinary Life
 of Padre Blas Valera, S.J.*

Sabine Hyland

THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN PRESS ANN ARBOR



Copyright © by the University of Michigan 2003

All rights reserved

Published in the United States of America by

The University of Michigan Press

Manufactured in the United States of America

© Printed on acid-free paper

2006 2005 2004 2003 4 3 2 1

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, or otherwise, without the written permission of the publisher.

A CIP catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Hyland, Sabine, 1964–

The Jesuit and the Incas : the extraordinary life of Padre Blas

Valera, S.J. / Sabine Hyland.

p. cm. — (History, languages, and cultures of the Spanish and Portuguese worlds)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-472-11353-4 (alk. paper)

1. Valera, Blas, 1551-1597. 2. Incas—Missions.
3. Jesuits—Peru—History. 4. Jesuits—Spain—History. I. Title.
II. Series.

BX4705.V2747 H95 2004

271'.5302—dc21

2003008359

To my husband, William

We were like strangers in our own city, visitors who had lost their way. It was your books that, as it were, brought us back home, so that at last we could recognize who we were, and where we were. It was you who revealed to us the age of our country, and sequence of events, the laws of religious ceremonies and of the priest-hoods, the traditional customs of private and public life, the position of geographical areas and of particular places, and the terminology of all matters, human and divine, with their various kinds, functions and causes.

—Cicero, writing about Marcus Terentius Varro,
quoted by St. Augustine in *The City of God*

Preface



This book grew out of my dissertation research on the debates over ordaining mestizos as Catholic priests in early colonial Peru. My dissertation, “Conversion, Custom, and ‘Culture’: Jesuit Racial Policies in Sixteenth-Century Peru” (Ph.D. dissertation, Yale University, 1994), focused specifically on the Jesuits’ attitudes toward mestizos in the viceroyalty. When the first members of the Society of Jesus arrived in Lima in 1568, they intended to encourage mestizo vocations to the Society. It was believed that mestizos—the children of Spanish fathers and native mothers—would make ideal missionaries, combining a Christian heritage from their fathers with a knowledge of native culture and language from their mothers. Yet fourteen years after arriving in South America, the Jesuits in Peru voted unanimously against ever allowing any mestizo to join the Society; this legislation would remain in place until the Jesuits were forced out of South America in the 1770s.

As I explored the reasons for this change of policy, speculating on how the Jesuits’ experience might shed light on the development of racial and cultural ideologies in Peru, I became intrigued with the story of one particular mestizo Jesuit—Blas Valera. Some Jesuits in Peru claimed that the reason for the ban on mestizos was Valera’s



PREFACE

misdeeds, which had proven mestizos to be unfit as priests. What were these heinous acts that Valera allegedly had committed? According to the Jesuits at the time, the Spanish Inquisition had convicted him of fornication and sentenced him to a long imprisonment. Yet, searching through Inquisition archives, I discovered that the Jesuits' story was false and that Valera had never even been brought before the Inquisition, let alone convicted by the Holy Office (see chap. 8 for the true story). Moreover, it became increasingly clear to me that Valera had been an ardent defender of the native peoples of Peru and had devoted his life to gathering the legends, histories, and myths of the native Andeans.

Therefore, I decided to write a biography of Valera, an entirely new book that would incorporate material from my dissertation. This biography was almost completed in 1996 when Laura Laurencich Minelli announced that a series of seventeenth-century documents had been discovered in Naples. These manuscripts make extraordinary claims about Blas Valera (see chaps. 9–10) that have inspired intense debates over the life of this mestizo priest. The passion behind these current controversies reveals how much the issues that dominated Valera's life—issues concerning native languages, cultures, and religion—are still vital today.

Many people have generously assisted me in writing this book. Richard Burger, as a dissertation director and colleague, has contributed his profound knowledge of Andean civilization and the Inca chroniclers; he is a model scholar and mentor, whose support and friendship over the years are deeply appreciated. This work has benefited also from numerous conversations with Mike Coe about Native American writing systems; his unwavering support during the writing of this book has meant a great deal to me. Noble David Cook trained me in Peruvian colonial history and paleography and helped to clarify my ideas about Blas Valera and mestizo ordination; his kindness is much appreciated.

This book owes a special debt of gratitude to Brian Bauer, who encouraged me to publish it and whose criticisms have improved the manuscript considerably. I am indebted also to Sabine MacCormack for her very careful and highly informed reading of the manuscript. Gary Urton's thoughtful comments have greatly improved the entire work, especially chapter 6—on language and writing. Frank

Preface

Salomon's suggestions for further clarifications have likewise benefited this work. Warren Church has provided insights into Chachapoya society, along with helpful comments on chapter 2.

I am very grateful to Laura Laurencich Minelli for her sincere friendship and support over the years of writing this book. Monica Barnes has contributed to this work in many ways, and her help is much appreciated. William Klimon provided invaluable bibliographic assistance. Many other friends and colleagues have provided assistance, criticism, and encouragement, including Harold Conklin, Davide Domenici, Maurizio Gnerre, Esther González, Teodoro Hampe Martínez, Bill Isbell, James John, Marti Lamar, Bruce Mannheim, René Millar Carvacho, Craig Morris, Jeremy Mumford, Joanne Pillsbury, Charles Reid, Elayne Zorn, and Tom Zuidema. My departmental colleagues, Cheryl Carpenter, Jim Benton, and Tom Faase, have patiently supported me through this endeavor.

Sabine MacCormack, Collin Ganio, and Chris Collins, of the University of Michigan Press, have been gracious and exemplary editors who have made this process as easy as possible. Erin Snoddy, Sarah Mann, and Jillian Downey have maintained their good humor while helping with the details of preparing the manuscript.

César Rodríguez, of Sterling Memorial Library at Yale University, has repeatedly given invaluable help with manuscripts at Yale. I would also like to thank the librarians and archivists at the Archivo Histórico Nacional in Madrid, the Biblioteca Nacional in Madrid, the Biblioteca de la Universidad de Sevilla, the Biblioteca de la Universidad de Salamanca, the Archivo General de Indias, the British Library, the Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Manuscripts and Archives in Sterling Memorial Library, the Pius XII Microfilm Collection at St. Louis University, the Harkness Collection at the Library of Congress, the New York Public Library, the Lilly Library at Indiana University at Bloomington, and the Rare Books Collection at St. Benedict's Abbey, Kansas. My thanks also go to Lynn Orlowski, the head of interlibrary loan at St. Norbert College, and to Paul Spaeth, director of the library at St. Bonaventure University.

The book has benefited greatly from the prayers and friendship of the Benedictine monks of St. Benedict's Abbey, Kansas, especially Father Denis Meade, O.S.B.; Father Benedict Laroque, O.S.B.; and Brother John Peto, O.S.B. I am also deeply grateful to the monks of



PREFACE

Conception Abbey, Missouri, for their prayers and friendship, especially Father Patrick Caveglia, O.S.B., Abbot Gregory Polan, O.S.B., and Brother Thomas Sullivan, O.S.B.

Much of chapter 8 originally appeared as the article “The Imprisonment of Blas Valera: Heresy and Inca History in Colonial Peru” in *Colonial Latin American Historical Review* 7, no. 1 (1998): 43–58.

The research for this book was supported by grants from the National Science Foundation, the National Endowment for the Humanities, the Andrew W. Mellon Foundation, the Williams Fellowship (Yale University), the Yale University Dissertation Fellowship, and the St. Norbert College Faculty Development Fund.

Finally, my largest debt is to my family. My mother, Sigrid Campbell, read through the manuscript and provided very useful comments and encouragement. I would like to thank my lovely daughters, Margaret and Eleanor, for sharing their mom with Blas Valera. My husband, Bill, has been at my side throughout all phases of this work. He has critically read the manuscript many times, provided translations of Latin texts, and cheerfully endured countless conversations about Blas Valera and the Naples documents. To him I owe more than I can adequately express.

Note on Translations and Orthography

The English translations of selections from Garcilaso de la Vega’s *Royal Commentaries of the Incas and General History of Peru* are from the translation by Harold V. Livermore (Garcilaso de la Vega 1987). Unless otherwise cited, all other translations from Spanish and Quechua are by the author. Translations from Latin are by William P. Hyland. To remain true to the spirit of the original sixteenth- and seventeenth-century documents, the spellings of Quechua words conform to the common usages of the colonial period.

Contents



List of Illustrations xv

- 1 Introduction 1
- 2 In “the land of strong men” 9
- 3 “. . . to go without subterfuge or excuse . . .” 32
- 4 Valera’s Writings and Sources 72
- 5 “. . . the age of our country and sequence of events . . .” 95
- 6 “. . . the terminology of all matters, human and divine . . .” 122
- 7 “. . . the laws of religious ceremonies and of the priesthoods . . .” 150
- 8 A Danger to Peru 183
- 9 The “Naples Documents” 195
- 10 The Continuing Controversy over Blas Valera 214

APPENDIXES

- A “Father Jerónimo Valera, O.F.M., on Native Rights, January 12, 1599” 239
- B “Testimony of Father Lucio Garcete, S.J., to the Inquisitors of Panama City, August 11, 1591” 243

References 245

Index 263

Illustrations



- 1 Luis Valera's signature, from the *Libro del cabildo . . . de Chachapoyas*, fol. 43b 13
- 2 Title page of Jerónimo Valera's *Commentarii ac Questiones in Universam Aristotelis* (1610) 26
- 3 Blas Valera's signature 30
- 4 Jesuit church in Cuzco 57
- 5 Anello Oliva, Additional MS 25.327, fol. 82a 80
- 6 Anello Oliva, Additional MS 25.327, fol. 116a 80
- 7 Anello Oliva, Additional MS 25.327, fol. 120a 81
- 8 Quipu 131
- 9 Paramonga quipus 138
- 10 "Royal" quipu symbols from Sansevero's *Lettera apologetica* (1750) 142
- 11 Remains of Coricancha, surmounted by the Church of Santo Domingo 167



Western South America