

LITIGATING IN THE SHADOW OF DEATH

Litigating in
the Shadow
of Death

*Defense Attorneys
in Capital Cases*

WELSH S. WHITE

THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN PRESS *Ann Arbor*

Copyright © by the University of Michigan 2006
All rights reserved
Published in the United States of America by
The University of Michigan Press
Manufactured in the United States of America
⊗ Printed on acid-free paper

2009 2008 2007 2006 4 3 2 1

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, or otherwise, without the written permission of the publisher.

A CIP catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

White, Welsh S., 1940-

Litigating in the shadow of death : defense attorneys in capital cases / Welsh S. White.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN-13: 978-0-472-09911-5 (cloth : alk. paper)

ISBN-10: 0-472-09911-6 (cloth : alk. paper)

ISBN-13: 978-0-472-06911-8 (pbk. : alk. paper)

ISBN-10: 0-472-06911-x (pbk. : alk. paper)

1. Capital punishment—United States. 2. Defense (Criminal procedure)—United States. I. Title.

KF9227.C2W453 2006

345.73'0773—dc22

2005022349

*To Anthony Amsterdam,
who blazed the path
for the many outstanding lawyers
who represent capital defendants
in the modern era of capital punishment.*

Acknowledgments

*A*lthough nearly all of the analysis contained in this book is new, I have at various points drawn from my previously published work in presenting accounts of either particular cases or Supreme Court doctrine. I would thus like to thank the following copyright holders for permission to excerpt material from the original sources.

Effective Assistance of Counsel in Capital Cases: The Evolving Standard of Care, 1993 U. ILL. L. REV. 323 by Welsh S. White. Reprinted with permission of the University of Illinois Law Review.

Confessions in Capital Cases, 2003 U. ILL. L. REV. 979 by Welsh S. White. Reprinted with permission of the University of Illinois Law Review.

A Deadly Dilemma: Choices by Attorneys Representing “Innocent” Capital Defendants, 102 MICH. L. REV. 2001 (2004) by Welsh S. White. Reprinted with permission of the University of Michigan Law Review.

I would also like to thank the attorneys whom I have interviewed over the past three years. In the Methodology Appendix, I have named the ones who were willing to have their names identified. These attorneys, as well as several others who preferred not to have their names mentioned, were incredibly generous not only in spending time explaining their work to me but also in providing materials and other information that would enable me to have a better understanding of their cases and the ways in which skilled capital defense attorneys represent their clients. Without the help of these attorneys, this book could not have even been contemplated. Although all of the attorneys deserve thanks, I would especially like to thank Stephen

Bright, Michael Burt, Michael Millman, David Bruck, and Russell Stetler for their invaluable comments on drafts of several of the chapters in the book.

I would also like to thank several people whose assistance enhanced the quality of the book. Albert Alschuler encouraged me to undertake this project and advised me as to how it should be approached. Andrew Taslitz gave me helpful advice relating to methodological issues. In addition to the others I have named, Stephen Garvey, John Parry, and David Harris read drafts of chapters and made helpful suggestions.

Finally, I would like to express my appreciation to the people who provided indispensable assistance in putting the manuscript together: the members of the Document Technology Center, LuAnn Driscoll, Karen Knochel, Darleen Mocello, and Barbara Salopek who did a superb job in preparing my manuscript; my research assistants, Timothy Lyon, Sara Chandler, and Paige Forster, who did an outstanding job in finding difficult sources and editing the manuscript; and my wife Linda, whose proofreading and other support were invaluable.

Contents

ONE	
The Role of Defense Lawyers in Capital Cases	1
TWO	
Effective Assistance of Counsel in Capital Cases	13
THREE	
Defending Capital Defendants Who Are Innocent	37
FOUR	
Defending Capital Defendants Who Have Strong Claims of Innocence	77
FIVE	
Defending a Capital Defendant in an Aggravated Case	105
SIX	
Plea Bargaining in Capital Cases	145
SEVEN	
Seeking Postconviction Relief in Capital Cases	173
EIGHT	
Concluding Observations	197
<i>Methodology Appendix</i>	209
<i>Table of Cases</i>	213
<i>Index</i>	217