

The Limits to Union

Law, Meaning, and Violence

The scope of Law, Meaning, and Violence is defined by the wide-ranging scholarly debates signaled by each of the words in the title. Those debates have taken place among and between lawyers, anthropologists, political theorists, sociologists, and historians, as well as literary and cultural critics. This series is intended to recognize the importance of such ongoing conversations about law, meaning, and violence as well as to encourage and further them.

Series Editors: Martha Minow, Harvard Law School
Elaine Scarry, Harvard University
Austin Sarat, Amherst College

Narrative, Violence, and the Law: The Essays of Robert Cover,
edited by Martha Minow, Michael Ryan, and Austin Sarat

Narrative, Authority, and Law, by Robin West

The Possibility of Popular Justice: A Case Study of Community Mediation in the United States, edited by Sally Engle Merry and Neal Milner

Legal Modernism, by David Luban

Surveillance, Privacy, and the Law: Employee Drug Testing and the Politics of Social Control,
by John Gilliom

Lives of Lawyers: Journeys in the Organizations of Practice, by Michael J. Kelly

Unleashing Rights: Law, Meaning, and the Animal Rights Movement, by Helena Silverstein

Law Stories, edited by Gary Bellow and Martha Minow

The Powers That Punish: Prison and Politics in the Era of the "Big House," 1920–1955,
by Charles Bright

Law and the Postmodern Mind: Essays on Psychoanalysis and Jurisprudence,
edited by Peter Goodrich and David Gray Carlson

Russia's Legal Fictions, by Harriet Murav

Strangers to the Law: Gay People on Trial, by Lisa Keen and Suzanne B. Goldberg

Butterfly, the Bride: Essays on Law, Narrative, and the Family, by Carol Weisbrod

The Politics of Community Policing: Rearranging the Power to Punish, by William Lyons

Laws of the Postcolonial, edited by Eve Darian-Smith and Peter Fitzpatrick

Whispered Consolations: Law and Narrative in African American Life,
by Jon-Christian Suggs

Bad Boys: Public Schools in the Making of Black Masculinity, by Ann Arnett Ferguson

Pain, Death, and the Law, edited by Austin Sarat

The Limits to Union: Same-Sex Marriage and the Politics of Civil Rights,
by Jonathan Goldberg-Hiller

The Limits to Union

*Same-Sex Marriage and the
Politics of Civil Rights*

JONATHAN GOLDBERG-HILLER

Ann Arbor

THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN PRESS

Copyright © by the University of Michigan 2002
All rights reserved
Published in the United States of America by
The University of Michigan Press
Manufactured in the United States of America
⊗ Printed on acid-free paper

2005 2004 2003 2002 4 3 2 1

No part of this publication may be reproduced,
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form
or by any means, electronic, mechanical, or otherwise,
without the written permission of the publisher.

A CIP catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Goldberg-Hiller, Jonathan, 1958–

The limits to union : same-sex marriage and the politics of civil
rights / Jonathan Goldberg-Hiller.

p. cm. — (Law, meaning, and violence)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-472-11223-6 (cloth : acid-free paper)

1. Same-sex marriage—United States. 2. Same-sex marriage—Law
and legislation—United States. 3. Gay rights—United States.
4. United States—Politics and government—1993–2001. 5. United
States—Social policy—1993– I. Title. II. Series.

HQ1034.U5 G65 2002

306.84'8—dc21

2001004251

For Sandy

Contents

Acknowledgments	ix
Chapter 1. A Trip to the “Alter”	1
Chapter 2. Sovereign Rites, Civil Rights	45
Chapter 3. The Status of Status	77
Chapter 4. Laboring for Rights	115
Chapter 5. Hawaiian Wedding Song	147
Chapter 6. Global Wedding Bells	181
Chapter 7. Conclusion—the Mourning After	221
Notes	237
Bibliography	265
Index	285

Acknowledgments

I have gained many worthwhile debts as this book has been written. Repayment must begin with some public acknowledgment and sincere thanks. My appreciation is extended to the many activists who gave me their time, sitting for interviews and helping me understand their fears, hopes, and expectations. Their names are too numerous to list here, but they can be found in the footnotes. Particular mention needs to be given to David Smith of the Human Rights Campaign, to Linda Rosehill, and to Barbara Ankersmit for their kind permission to examine polling data and public relations materials that guided the campaign for same-sex marriage in Hawai'i.

I am also grateful to the many scholars who have read earlier drafts and chapters of this book and given me invaluable counsel. In order of the alphabet, I wish to thank Julia Adams, Kathy Ferguson, Alexandra French, Shelley Gavigan, Manfred Henningsen, Didi Herman, Kaleikoa Ka'eo, S. Krishna, Neal Milner, Shane Phelan, Sandy Schram, Mike Shapiro, Noenoe Silva, Nevzat Soguk, Carl Stychin, Phyllis Turnbull, and several anonymous readers. Their suggestions have been important to the shape of this book, although as author I take full responsibility for what it says. A special acknowledgment and thank-you goes to Austin Sarat, whose own enthusiasm for my project was a frequent inspiration. My gratitude is also due Jeremy Shine and Charles Myers, who have been unparalleled editors.

Previous aspects of this research have been published in *Social and Legal Studies*; in *Studies in Law, Politics, and Society*; in *Sexuality in the Legal Arena*, edited by Didi Herman and Carl Stychin (London: Athlone Press, 2000); in *Laboring for Rights: A Global Perspective on Union Response to Sexual Diversity*, edited by Gerald Hunt (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1999); and in *Tales of the State*, edited by Sanford F. Schram and Philip T. Neisser (Lanham, Md.: Rowman and Littlefield,

1997). I thank these publishers and editors for permission to use this material in this book.

Finally, I wish to acknowledge the University of Hawai'i Department of Political Science and its inspirational faculty, graduate students, and staff. As a home in which to study critical theories, to teach, and to write, no ka oi.