

Managing Readers

Editorial Theory and Literary Criticism

George Bornstein, Series Editor

Series Editorial Board

Jo Ann Boydston, Southern Illinois University

Hans Walter Gabler, University of Munich

A. Walton Litz, Princeton University

Jerome J. McGann, University of Virginia

Peter Shillingsburg, Mississippi State University

Palimpsest: Editorial Theory in the Humanities, edited by George Bornstein and Ralph G. Williams

Contemporary German Editorial Theory, edited by Hans Walter Gabler, George Bornstein, and Gillian Borland Pierce

The Hall of Mirrors: Drafts & Fragments and the End of Ezra Pound's Cantos, by Peter Stoicheff

Textualterity: Art, Theory, and Textual Criticism, by Joseph Grigely

Emily Dickinson's Open Folios: Scenes of Reading, Surfaces of Writing, by Marta L. Werner

Editing D. H. Lawrence: New Versions of a Modern Author, edited by Charles L. Ross and Dennis Jackson

Scholarly Editing in the Computer Age: Theory and Practice, Third Edition, by Peter L. Shillingsburg

The Literary Text in the Digital Age, edited by Richard J. Finneran

The Margins of the Text, edited by D. C. Greetham

A Poem Containing History: Textual Studies in The Cantos, edited by Lawrence S. Rainey

Much Labouring: The Texts and Authors of Yeats's First Modernist Books, by David Holdeman

Resisting Texts: Authority and Submission in Constructions of Meaning, by Peter L. Shillingsburg

The Iconic Page in Manuscript, Print, and Digital Culture, edited by George Bornstein and Theresa Tinkle

Collaborative Meaning in Medieval Scribal Culture: The Otho Lazamon, by Elizabeth J. Bryan

Oscar Wilde's Decorated Books, by Nicholas Frankel

Managing Readers: Printed Marginalia in English Renaissance Books, by William W. E. Slights

Managing Readers

Printed Marginalia in English Renaissance Books

WILLIAM W. E. SLIGHTS

Ann Arbor

THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN PRESS

Copyright © by the University of Michigan 2001

All rights reserved

Published in the United States of America by

The University of Michigan Press

Manufactured in the United States of America

⊗ Printed on acid-free paper

2004 2003 2002 2001 4 3 2 1

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, or otherwise, without the written permission of the publisher.

A CIP catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Slights, William W. E.

Managing readers : printed marginalia in English Renaissance books
/ William W. E. Slights.

p. cm. — (Editorial theory and literary criticism)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-472-11229-5 (acid-free paper)

1. Marginalia. 2. Books and reading—England—History—16th century. 3. Books and reading—England—History—17th century. 4. Early printed books—16th century. 5. Early printed books—17th century. 6. Transmission of texts. I. Title. II. Series.

Z1003.5.G7 S58 2002

028'.9'0942—dc21

2001004248

The small figure that appears at the head of each section was drawn by a youngster named Jonathan on the front end-papers of a copy of the anonymous *Christian religion substantially treatised* (1611) now in the British Library. Jonathan was practicing his penmanship, including a number of small, stylized flowers of the sort used by such early marginal annotators as Ben Jonson, to mark passages of special interest. In this case, the flowers became decorations on a shirt for the whimsical little creature that the boy created by adding eyes, a nose, and a pair of “J”s for feet.



For Camille and Jessica

Contents

| | |
|--|-----|
| List of Illustrations | ix |
| Acknowledgments | xi |
| Introduction | 1 |
| Chapter 1. The Edifying Margins of Renaissance English Books | 19 |
| Chapter 2. A Theory of Margination | 61 |
| Chapter 3. “Marginall Notes That Spoile the Text”: Scriptural Annotation in the English Renaissance | 101 |
| Chapter 4. The Cosmopolitics of Reading: Navigating the Margins of John Dee’s <i>General and Rare Memorials</i> | 129 |
| Chapter 5. NB: 1605 | 157 |
| Chapter 6. Discording Chronologers: Reshaping History on the Margins | 183 |
| Chapter 7. Briefe, Trew, and Contentious as Hell: The Voice from the Margins of Religious Polemics | 223 |
| Afterword | 259 |
| Works Cited | 263 |
| Index | 285 |

List of Illustrations

| | |
|--|-----|
| 1. Lightly annotated page of <i>The Holy Bible . . . Appointed to be read in churches</i> (King James Version) | 4 |
| 2. Printed and handwritten marginalia in John Dee, <i>General and Rare Memorials</i> | 5 |
| 3. Vertical marginalia in Hugh Broughton, <i>A Conccent of Scripture</i> | 27 |
| 4. Ben Jonson, <i>Seianvs His Fall</i> , quarto edition, with sidenotes | 30 |
| 5. Ben Jonson, <i>Seianvs His Fall</i> , folio edition, without sidenotes | 31 |
| 6. Incursion of marginalia into the text in John Dee, <i>General and Rare Memorials</i> | 47 |
| 7. Edmund Spenser, <i>The Shepheardes Calender</i> , E.K.'s gloss on May | 48 |
| 8. Listrius's commentary in Erasmus, <i>Encomium moriae</i> | 53 |
| 9. Holbein frontispiece from the Great Bible | 112 |
| 10. Great Bible, Genesis 11, building the Tower of Babel | 113 |
| 11. Geneva Bible, Revelations | 122 |
| 12. John Dee, <i>General and Rare Memorials</i> , showing decorative initial capital and varied typefaces | 143 |
| 13. Queen Elizabeth within the letter C, from John Dee, <i>General and Rare Memorials</i> | 152 |
| 14. The allegorical title page designed by Dee for the <i>General and Rare Memorials</i> | 153 |
| 15. T[homas] M[orton], <i>An exact discoverie of the Romish doctrine in the case of conspiracie and rebellion</i> , quotation and commentary on facing pages | 164 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 16. William Bradshaw, <i>Treatise of the nature and use of things indifferent</i> | 169 |
| 17. William Camden, <i>Annales of . . . Elizabeth queene of England</i> | 200 |
| 18. Tacitus, <i>The Ende of Nero and the beginning of Galba</i> , with two levels of annotation | 205 |
| 19. History of Cunobeline (Cymbeline), in John Speed, <i>The History of Great Britaine</i> | 220 |
| 20. Replies to a Puritan tract in John Whitgift, <i>An Answer to a certen libel intituled, An Admonition . . . Newly augmented</i> | 229 |
| 21. Benjamin Pullen's fair copy of Richard Hooker's <i>Of the Lawes of Ecclesiasticall Politie</i> | 239 |
| 22. "The Plan" of Christian's route to the Celestial City prefaced to John Bunyan's <i>The Pilgrim's Progress</i> | 248 |

Acknowledgments

Having lived and taught in New York City at one point before moving to Saskatoon, Saskatchewan, I thought I understood the difference between life at the center and on the margins. Now I'm not so sure. My adopted country, city, and university have provided me a supportive intellectual environment as well as some great hunting and fishing. In an age of electronic communications and quick if not plentiful planes, Saskatoon has become my center, one that also offers the perspective from the margins that I have come to respect deeply through my study of early modern marginalia.

In carrying out this study I have incurred substantial debts to a host of librarians, appointed keepers of the page, rare and otherwise. I have received friendly and prompt assistance from the staffs of the Henry E. Huntington, Folger Shakespeare, Bodleian, and British libraries, as well as the university libraries of Alberta (Special Collections), Illinois (Rare Book Collection), and last but far from least, Saskatchewan. My special thanks go to the Interlibrary Loan Division of the University of Saskatchewan Library, particularly to Michael Brockbank, who provided not only books from afar but also hockey and automobile information, as well as holiday meals (with Colleen's expert help) when they were really needed.

I could never have gotten to so many remote libraries and quiet havens of scholarship as I have without financial support from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada and the University of Saskatchewan President's SSHRCC fund. I stand in their debt and have done my best to make it good. The level of support was generous but never luxurious. My wife adjusted her tolerances courageously in Pasadena where we had to share our quarters with a veritable Ho Chi Minh Trail of ants, a pair of surly left-behind dogs, and a tenant who passed silently

through our bedroom on the way to her attic garret, and also in Oxford, where we gathered shivering with our daughter around the pitiful gas fire in the sitting room at teatime. Without lovely people in each place, all three of us would have slipped into Grumbly Scholar Syndrome. As it was, only I did.

And so, on to those people, especially the lovers of old books with marginal notes. During an annus mirabilis at the Huntington, I got to meet and work with visitors Paul Christianson, Bob Evans, Achsah Guibory, Grace Ioppola, Jennifer Bradley, Tom Luxon, and Paul Stevens, as well as regulars Liz and Dan Donno, Barry Medicoff, Jim Riddell, John Steadman, and Jim Thorpe. These and other scholars would occasionally pass by my desk and drop a 3 × 5 card with a title and the note, “Good marginalia.” Sometimes they turned out to be *great* marginalia. Michael Shapiro and his wonderful wife Elizabeth Klein put me up and held me together while my mother was dying and I was working with rare books at my alma mater, the University of Illinois.

Closer to home, I have had stimulating conversations about things marginal with my colleagues Anthony Harding, Judith Henderson, Peter Stoicheff, and Andrew Taylor. Peter Burnell and Lewis Stiles of our now sadly defunct Department of Classics pitched in enthusiastically whenever I had questions involving Latin and Greek. I have had research assistance from several University of Saskatchewan graduate students—Emund Bamiro, Arul Kumaran, and Connie Ratt—and I have been guided through the intricacies of several computer programs by the Patient Griselda of the electronic environment, Pamela Giles.

Drafts and fragments of *Managing Readers* have been carefully read and noticeably improved by numerous scholars of marginalia and of the early modern book. Richard Helgerson, Fritz Levy, and Debora Shuger have read individual chapters and groomed them smartly. Heather Jackson, who shared with me her own dazzling manuscript on marginalia of the handwritten variety, read all of what I had written and saved me from a whole raft of small and not-so-small errors. Lyn Tribble, the best scholar of the printed margins that I know, made valuable suggestions about organizing my masses of material. Bill Sherman read and commented extensively on the manuscript not just once but twice, urging me to engage with some of the most recent and provocative arguments concerning the transition from script to print cultures, the authority of the text, and conflicting theories of the margins. Some of the best of those arguments have been crafted by Sherman himself.

George Bornstein, diligent and distinguished editor of the Editorial and Literary Criticism Series, and LeAnn Fields, executive editor at the University of Michigan Press, have cleverly and kindly labored to persuade me that I have something worthwhile to say to students of the history of the book, the page, and reading. I appreciate their confidence.

I am grateful to *Renaissance Quarterly*, the *Huntington Library Quarterly*, and the University of Michigan Press for permission to reprint essays that I have revised into chapters 1, 3, and 4 of the present volume.

The Renaissance scholar-critic-teacher whose work I most admire has been both margin and center of my life during the book's creation. It is dedicated to her and to our daughter.

