

Speaking the Same Language

Speaking the Same Language

Speech and Audience in
Thucydides' Spartan Debates

PAULA DEBNAR

Ann Arbor
THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN PRESS

τοῖς φίλοις

Copyright © by the University of Michigan 2001
All rights reserved
Published in the United States of America by
The University of Michigan Press
Manufactured in the United States of America
Ⓢ Printed on acid-free paper

2004 2003 2002 2001 4 3 2 1

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, or otherwise, without the written permission of the publisher.

A CIP catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data applied for
ISBN 0-472-11236-8 (cloth: alk. paper)

Preface

This book is an examination of the role played by the internal audiences in Thucydides' *History of the Peloponnesian War* and focuses on debates in which Spartans are either speakers or auditors. My analysis for the most part takes the form of discursive commentaries on the speeches, with particular consideration given to the historical as well as the narrative context. I make no apology for this approach; Thucydides demands close reading coupled with attention to historical detail.

As is true of any study of Thucydides, the organization of *Speaking the Same Language* is itself a structure imposed on the History. Its three parts correspond to a progressive change I perceive in Spartan discourse—and attitudes to discourse—as the History moves farther away from the prewar debates in Sparta in both time and place. There are of course numerous details that do not fit easily into this schema. Nonetheless, a large-scale movement of profound significance is the result of the individual speeches and events in the History. As Thucydides says concerning the plague, a general phenomenon can be recognized even when individual cases differ (2.51.1). Without such a view of the relation of particular and general, he would not have been able to speak of “what happened and what will happen—or something close to it—given what is human” (1.22.4).

Since my hope is that this book will be of use to a broad range of readers of Thucydides, I have translated all the Greek in the main text. Except where noted, translations are my own; I have tried to adhere closely to Thucydides' often awkward Greek, especially where the word order has some bearing on my analysis. The notes are addressed primarily to scholars; discussions of syntactical and textual problems of the Greek, and of points of historical fact, are restricted to those areas where they most affect my argument. I have retained the latinized forms of Greek proper and geographical names, more out of fondness than any ideological conviction. Unless otherwise noted, all

in-text references are to Thucydides; citations are from the Oxford text by Stuart Jones and Powell, and references to the scholia are to Hude.

My deepest gratitude goes to Mary Bellino, a fine Hellenist whose superb editorial skills and relentless queries helped to deliver this book from a purgatory of drafts. In this project as well as in earlier articles, I have benefited greatly from Justina Gregory's astute observations and suggestions. I extend my thanks as well to Carolyn Dewald, Jeffrey Rusten, and my anonymous referees for their detailed comments. And for invaluable assistance at the beginning and the end of a seemingly interminable process, I would like to thank Ellen Bauerle, for her enthusiastic response to my initial submission, and Joan Davis, for her splendid work on the index.

Contents

ix	List of Abbreviations
1	Introduction
25	PART ONE • SPARTANS AT HOME
27	Introduction to Part I
30	CHAPTER ONE • The Spartans as Audience
59	CHAPTER TWO • The Spartans among Themselves
77	CHAPTER THREE • The League as Audience
91	PART TWO • SPARTANS ABROAD
93	Introduction to Part II
96	CHAPTER FOUR • The Seige of Plataea
102	CHAPTER FIVE • The Politics of Olympia
125	CHAPTER SIX • The Trial of the Plataeans
147	CHAPTER SEVEN • Pylos and the Offer of Peace
169	PART THREE • ENEMIES WITHIN
171	Introduction to Part III
173	CHAPTER EIGHT • Brasidas' Spartans
201	CHAPTER NINE • Alcibiades' Spartans
221	Conclusion
235	Bibliography
245	Index of Greek Terms
247	General Index

Abbreviations

For classical authors and works the abbreviations used are those of *The Oxford Classical Dictionary*.

Andrewes	Commentary in A. Gomme, A. Andrewes, and K. Dover. 1970. <i>A Historical Commentary on Thucydides</i> , IV. Oxford.
Classen-Steup	J. Classen; revised J. Steup. 1900–1922. <i>Thukydidēs</i> . Berlin.
Dover	Commentary in A. Gomme, A. Andrewes, and K. Dover. 1970. <i>A Historical Commentary on Thucydides</i> , IV. Oxford.
FGH	F. Jacoby. 1962. <i>Die Fragmente der griechische Historiker</i> , II B. Leiden.
Gomme	A. Gomme. 1945–70. <i>A Historical Commentary on Thucydides</i> , I–IV. Oxford.
Graves	C. E. Graves. 1884. <i>The Fourth Book of Thucydides</i> . London. 1891. <i>The Fifth Book of Thucydides</i> . London.
Hornblower	S. Hornblower. 1991. <i>A Commentary on Thucydides</i> , I. Oxford. 1996. <i>A Commentary on Thucydides</i> , II. Oxford.
IG	<i>Inscriptiones Graecae</i> . 1843–. Berlin.
LSJ	H. G. Liddell, and R. Scott; revised H. Stuart Jones. 1925–40. <i>A Greek-English Lexicon</i> . 9th ed. Oxford.
Marchant	E. C. Marchant. 1891. <i>Thucydides: Book II</i> . London. 1902. <i>Thucydides: Book VI</i> . London. 1905. <i>Thucydides: Book I</i> . London. 1909. <i>Thucydides: Book III</i> . London.
OCT	H. Stuart Jones, ed.; revised J. Powell. 1942. <i>Thucydidis Historiae</i> . Oxford.

- Poppo-Stahl E. F. Poppo; revised J. M. Stahl. 1876–85. *Thucydidis de bello peloponnesiaco libri octo*. Berlin.
- RE A. Pauly, G. Wissowa, and W. Kroll. 1894–1980. *Real-Encyclopädie der classischen Altertumswissenschaft*. Stuttgart.
- Rusten J. Rusten. 1989. *Thucydides, The Peloponnesian War, Book II*. Cambridge.
- Scholia C. Hude, ed. 1927; rpt. 1973. *Scholia in Thucydidem*. London.
- SIG W. Dittenberger. 1960. *Sylloge Inscriptionum Graecarum*, I. 4th ed. Hildesheim.
- Smyth H. W. Smyth, revised G. Messing. 1984. *Greek Grammar*. Cambridge, Mass.
- Spratt A. W. Spratt.
1896. *Thucydides: Book III*. Cambridge.
1905. *Thucydides: Book VI*. Cambridge.
1912. *Thucydides: Book IV*. Cambridge.
- Steup, *Anhang* Appendices in Classen-Steup.