

VOLATILE STATES

VOLATILE STATES

Institutions, Policy, and the Performance
of American State Economies

W. Mark Crain

THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN PRESS
Ann Arbor

Copyright © by the University of Michigan 2003

All rights reserved

Published in the United States of America by

The University of Michigan Press

Manufactured in the United States of America

♻️ Printed on acid-free paper

2006 2005 2004 2003 4 3 2 1

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, or otherwise, without the written permission of the publisher.

A CIP catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Crain, W. Mark.

Volatile states : institutions, policy, and the performance of American state economies / W. Mark Crain.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-472-11303-8 (Cloth : alk. paper)

I. Finance, Public—United States—States. 2. Taxation—United States—States. 3. U.S. states—Economic policy. I. Title.

HJ275 .C69 2003

330.973'092—dc21

2002011938

To Nicole

Acknowledgments

I wish to thank several colleagues and friends for taking an interest in this project and for helping me along the way. Richard Boyland, Bryan Caplan, Nicole Crain, Matt Dobra, John Dunham, Jim Miller, Clair Smith, Dean Stansel, Bob Tollison, and Wayne Winegarden offered constructive comments on the manuscript. In addition, four anonymous reviewers for the University of Michigan Press offered detailed suggestions on an earlier draft. Carol Robert assisted cheerfully in the chores required to move the project forward from its crudest stages to the final product. I am grateful to my editor, Ellen McCarthy, for her oversight, encouragement, excitement, and patience. Mary Meade, Kevin Rennells, and Ann Schultz at the University of Michigan Press guided me through the production hoops. Jean Crain and John Gilchrist provided the family push that never allowed me to give up. Alexander Crain and Juliet Crain made me want to connect to at least two readers 20 years down the road. I am also grateful to many students at George Mason University who listened patiently to a host of half-baked ideas. Partial financial support for the project was generously provided by the James M. Buchanan Center for Political Economy, the Center for Study of Public Choice, the Mercatus Center, and the Phillip Morris Management Corporation. All errors remain my responsibility.

Contents

List of Illustrations	xi
List of Tables	xiii
Introduction: Economic and Fiscal Performance in a Mean-Variance Perspective	I
1. Champions of the State Growth League	5
2. The End of State Income Convergence	25
3. Volatile States: Estimates of the Risk-Return Trade-Off	31
4. Demise of the State Sales Tax	50
5. Economic Consequences of State Tax Policy	64
6. Reliability of Revenues from Alternative Tax Instruments	73
7. State Budgets Outgrow State Incomes	82
8. Fiscal Uncertainty: The Enemy of Efficient Budgeting	96
9. Political Ideology and Other Drivers of State Budget Priorities	119
10. Fresh Perspectives on Familiar Problems	138
Notes	143
References	155
Index	163

Illustrations

1.1.	Trajectory of U.S. living standards	6
1.2.	Decline of U.S. income growth rates in the twentieth century	7
1.3.	Comparison of state economies (in real income per capita), 1969–99	11
1.4.	Distribution of state growth rates, 1969–99	14
1.5.	Comparison of state economies (in real income per worker), 1969–99	15
1.6.	Changes in relative living standards over three decades (in income per capita)	21
1.7.	Changes in relative living standards over three decades (in income per worker)	23
2.1.	End of state income convergence	26
2.2.	Pattern of convergence in state income per worker	27
3.1.	Regression Volatility index, income per capita	38
3.2.	Innovation Volatility index, income per capita	39
3.3.	Regression Volatility index, income per worker	40
3.4.	Innovation Volatility index, income per worker	41
3.5.	Estimated trade-off between volatility and income per capita	46
3.6.	Estimated trade-off between volatility and income per worker	47
4.1.	Changing composition of state tax revenues	52
4.2.	Convergence/divergence among states in the structure of taxes	55
4.3.	Convergence/divergence among states in average tax rates	56
7.1.	State spending growth compared to income growth, 1969–98	83
7.2.	State spending growth compared to federal spending relative to income, 1969–98	84
7.3.	Comparison of state spending growth (in real spending per capita), 1969–98	86

7.4.	Comparison of state spending growth (in spending relative to income), 1969–98	87
7.5.	Effect of initial government size on growth in spending per capita	88
7.6.	Effect of initial government size on growth in spending relative to income	89
7.7.	Convergence among states in spending per capita	90
7.8.	Convergence among states in spending as a share of income	91
7.9.	Changes in relative spending over three decades (in spending per capita)	92
7.10.	Changes in relative spending over three decades (in spending relative to income)	94
8.1.	Uncertainty of future funding levels and agency costs	98
8.2.	Trade-off between budget volatility and spending per capita	109
8.3.	Trade-off between budget volatility and spending as a share of income	110
9.1.	Major components of state budgets in 1998	120
9.2.	Major components of state budgets in 1969	120
9.3.	Comparative growth in major budget components, 1969–98	122
9.4.	Convergence/divergence among states in budget priorities (spending per capita)	124
9.5.	Convergence/divergence among states in budget priorities (spending as a share of income)	125
9.6.	Convergence/divergence among states in budget priorities (spending as a share of total state budget)	126
9.7.	Effect of citizen and government ideology on total spending	135
9.8.	Effect of citizen ideology on budget priorities	136

Tables

1.1.	U.S. income growth rates, comparison of time periods	8
1.2.	Significant decline in U.S. economic growth	8
1.3.	U.S. economic growth rates in last half of the twentieth century	9
1.4.	State rankings for real income per capita growth, 1969–99	13
1.5.	State rankings for real income per worker growth, 1969–99	17
1.6.	State rankings based on real income per capita (in 2000 \$)	18
1.7.	State rankings based on real income per worker (in 2000 \$)	20
2.1.	Barro-type test for state income convergence, 1969–99	28
3.1.	Core variables used to explain state income, 1969–99	34
3.2.	Economic volatility measures by state, 1969–99	35
3.3.	Correlation matrix for state volatility measures	36
3.4.	Relationship between level and volatility of income, 1969–99	45
3.A1.	Summary statistics and data sources	48
3.A2.	Relationship between level and volatility of income, 1969–99	49
4.1.	Major sources of state tax revenues: 1998 and changes since 1969	53
4.2.	State personal income taxes: marginal and average tax rates, 1969–98	59
4.3.	State sales taxes: marginal and average tax rates, 1969–98	60
4.4.	Total state taxes: marginal and average tax rates, 1969–98	61
5.1.	Impact of marginal tax rates on state income, 1969–98	68
5.2.	Impact of marginal tax rates on state income growth, 1969–98	69
5.A1.	Impact of marginal tax rates on state income, 1969–98	72
6.1.	Volatility in revenues from sales taxes and individual income taxes, 1968–98	76

6.2.	Revenue volatility from tax diversification versus a single tax instrument, 1968–98	79
8.1.	Core variables used to explain state government expenditures	105
8.2.	Effects of fiscal institutions on state government expenditures per capita	106
8.3.	Effects of fiscal institutions on state government expenditures as a share of income	107
8.4.	Effects of fiscal institutions on state government revenues	113
8.5.	Effects of fiscal institutions on state tax revenues	114
8.6.	Effects of institutions and tax revenue volatility on state spending volatility	116
8.A1.	Summary statistics and data sources	118
9.1.	Political ideology ratings	129
9.2.	Major budget components: regression results for core models with demographic and economics factors	130
9.3.	Major budget components: regression results for expenditure volatility and fiscal institutions	131
9.4.	Relative importance of ideology versus expenditure volatility: elasticity estimates	132
9.5.	Relative importance of ideology versus expenditure volatility: impact on per capita spending of a 1 percent increase	132
9.6.	Major budget components: regression results for Citizen and Government Political Ideology indices	134
9.A1.	Summary statistics and data sources	137