VOLATILE STATES
VOLATILE STATES

Institutions, Policy, and the Performance of American State Economies

W. Mark Crain

THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN PRESS
Ann Arbor
To Nicole
I wish to thank several colleagues and friends for taking an interest in this project and for helping me along the way. Richard Boyland, Bryan Caplan, Nicole Crain, Matt Dobra, John Dunham, Jim Miller, Clair Smith, Dean Stansel, Bob Tollison, and Wayne Winegarden offered constructive comments on the manuscript. In addition, four anonymous reviewers for the University of Michigan Press offered detailed suggestions on an earlier draft. Carol Robert assisted cheerfully in the chores required to move the project forward from its crudest stages to the final product. I am grateful to my editor, Ellen McCarthy, for her oversight, encouragement, excitement, and patience. Mary Meade, Kevin Rennells, and Ann Schultz at the University of Michigan Press guided me through the production hoops. Jean Crain and John Gilchrist provided the family push that never allowed me to give up. Alexander Crain and Juliet Crain made me want to connect to at least two readers 20 years down the road. I am also grateful to many students at George Mason University who listened patiently to a host of half-baked ideas. Partial financial support for the project was generously provided by the James M. Buchanan Center for Political Economy, the Center for Study of Public Choice, the Mercatus Center, and the Phillip Morris Management Corporation. All errors remain my responsibility.
Contents

List of Illustrations xi
List of Tables xiii
Introduction: Economic and Fiscal Performance in a Mean-Variance Perspective 1
1. Champions of the State Growth League 5
2. The End of State Income Convergence 25
4. Demise of the State Sales Tax 50
5. Economic Consequences of State Tax Policy 64
6. Reliability of Revenues from Alternative Tax Instruments 73
7. State Budgets Outgrow State Incomes 82
9. Political Ideology and Other Drivers of State Budget Priorities 119
10. Fresh Perspectives on Familiar Problems 138
Notes 143
References 155
Index 163
Illustrations

1.1. Trajectory of U.S. living standards 6
1.2. Decline of U.S. income growth rates in the twentieth century 7
1.3. Comparison of state economies (in real income per capita), 1969–99 11
1.4. Distribution of state growth rates, 1969–99 14
1.5. Comparison of state economies (in real income per worker), 1969–99 15
1.6. Changes in relative living standards over three decades (in income per capita) 21
1.7. Changes in relative living standards over three decades (in income per worker) 23
2.1. End of state income convergence 26
2.2. Pattern of convergence in state income per worker 27
3.1. Regression Volatility index, income per capita 38
3.2. Innovation Volatility index, income per capita 39
3.3. Regression Volatility index, income per worker 40
3.4. Innovation Volatility index, income per worker 41
3.5. Estimated trade-off between volatility and income per capita 46
3.6. Estimated trade-off between volatility and income per worker 47
4.1. Changing composition of state tax revenues 52
4.2. Convergence/divergence among states in the structure of taxes 53
4.3. Convergence/divergence among states in average tax rates 56
7.1. State spending growth compared to income growth, 1969–98 83
7.2. State spending growth compared to federal spending relative to income, 1969–98 84
7.3. Comparison of state spending growth (in real spending per capita), 1969–98 86
7.4. Comparison of state spending growth (in spending relative to income), 1969–98 87
7.5. Effect of initial government size on growth in spending per capita 88
7.6. Effect of initial government size on growth in spending relative to income 89
7.7. Convergence among states in spending per capita 90
7.8. Convergence among states in spending as a share of income 91
7.9. Changes in relative spending over three decades (in spending per capita) 92
7.10. Changes in relative spending over three decades (in spending relative to income) 94
8.1. Uncertainty of future funding levels and agency costs 98
8.2. Trade-off between budget volatility and spending per capita 109
8.3. Trade-off between budget volatility and spending as a share of income 110
9.1. Major components of state budgets in 1998 120
9.2. Major components of state budgets in 1969 120
9.3. Comparative growth in major budget components, 1969–98 122
9.4. Convergence/divergence among states in budget priorities (spending per capita) 124
9.5. Convergence/divergence among states in budget priorities (spending as a share of income) 125
9.6. Convergence/divergence among states in budget priorities (spending as a share of total state budget) 126
9.7. Effect of citizen and government ideology on total spending 135
9.8. Effect of citizen ideology on budget priorities 136
### Tables

1.1. U.S. income growth rates, comparison of time periods 8
1.2. Significant decline in U.S. economic growth 8
1.3. U.S. economic growth rates in last half of the twentieth century 9
1.4. State rankings for real income per capita growth, 1969–99 13
1.5. State rankings for real income per worker growth, 1969–99 17
1.6. State rankings based on real income per capita (in 2000 $) 18
1.7. State rankings based on real income per worker (in 2000 $) 20
3.1. Core variables used to explain state income, 1969–99 34
3.2. Economic volatility measures by state, 1969–99 35
3.3. Correlation matrix for state volatility measures 36
3.4. Relationship between level and volatility of income, 1969–99 45
3.A2. Relationship between level and volatility of income, 1969–99 49
4.2. State personal income taxes: marginal and average tax rates, 1969–98 59
4.3. State sales taxes: marginal and average tax rates, 1969–98 60
4.4. Total state taxes: marginal and average tax rates, 1969–98 61
5.1. Impact of marginal tax rates on state income, 1969–98 68
5.2. Impact of marginal tax rates on state income growth, 1969–98 69
6.1. Volatility in revenues from sales taxes and individual income taxes, 1968–98 76
6.2. Revenue volatility from tax diversification versus a single tax instrument, 1968–98 79
8.1. Core variables used to explain state government expenditures 105
8.2. Effects of fiscal institutions on state government expenditures per capita 106
8.3. Effects of fiscal institutions on state government expenditures as a share of income 107
8.4. Effects of fiscal institutions on state government revenues 113
8.5. Effects of fiscal institutions on state tax revenues 114
8.6. Effects of institutions and tax revenue volatility on state spending volatility 116
9.1. Political ideology ratings 129
9.2. Major budget components: regression results for core models with demographic and economics factors 130
9.3. Major budget components: regression results for expenditure volatility and fiscal institutions 131
9.4. Relative importance of ideology versus expenditure volatility: elasticity estimates 132
9.5. Relative importance of ideology versus expenditure volatility: impact on per capita spending of a 1 percent increase 132