The Limits of Heroism
The Limits of Heroism

Homer and the Ethics of Reading

Mark Buchan

THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN PRESS
Ann Arbor
To my parents
Acknowledgments

This book on the *Odyssey* has been long in the making and has accompanied me on my own voyage through four universities. Because of this, it bears the intellectual imprint of many friends, colleagues, and students who have had the energy and patience to read over parts or all of it in its various forms, as well as of the even more numerous who have argued with me in person over its central tenets. It is a book about the complicated process of desiring, about the way the Homeric poems complicate our everyday notions of what it means to want something, and about the strange way in which an individual’s desire is inevitably and inextricably bound up in the desires of others. It is therefore a pleasure to be able to thank at least some of the fellow travelers who, by wanting me to write this book, have helped me to want to write it.

Ann Hansen, Sara Rappe, Sally Humphreys, Santiago Colas, and Gregory Nagy all read and commented on the full manuscript. Simon Goldhill, Stephen Hinds, Ruth Webb, John Kittmer, and Gina Soter read and discussed assorted parts with me, as did Tim and Emily Gowers. I also owe a great deal to the intellectual enthusiasm and support of many others: at Bristol, to Duncan Kennedy, Charles Martindale, Ellen O’Gorman, and Vanda Zajko; at the University of Washington, to Susan Lape and Cathy Connors; at Northwestern, to Ahuvia Kahane and Bob Wallace; at Princeton, to Andy Ford, Froma Zeitlin, Josh Katz, Giovanna Ceserani, and John Ma. I also benefited from the comments of two anonymous readers. Thanks also to Kirk Ormand and Denise McCoskey.

The book tries to revisit the central questions of the Homeric poems—the problems of human identity, the value of human life, the logic of heroic ideology. Perhaps because of this, most of the arguments I put forth here have sprung directly from debates in the classroom over the last decade, with both graduate and undergraduate students alike. Though I am happy to take responsibility for all that is said, this text now seems to me to be a composite,
written version of all those classroom conversations. I am thus immensely grateful to the students who made it such a pleasure to teach and reteach these poems.

Finally, I would like to make special mention of James Porter. I have long stopped trying to puzzle out where his thinking ends and mine begins in this manuscript, but a thousand footnotes could not do justice to his influence. Thanks.


Contents

Introduction 1

1. Polyphemus: The Blinding of a Cyclops 18

2. Phaeacia: The Impossible Choice of Subjectivity 36

3. In the Beginning Was Proteus 50

4. From Stones to Statehood: Sublime Objects in the Odyssey 72

5. Metis and Monstrosity: Odysseus’ and Demodocus’ Battle of Wits 89

6. The Limits of Heroism 107

7. The Odyssey from the Perspective of Its Victims 133

8. What Does a Phaeacian Woman Want? 181

9. Penelope as Parthenos 206

Notes 237
References 269
Index 275