

THE
ONE-STATE
Solution

THE
ONE-STATE
Solution

A Breakthrough
for Peace in the
Israeli-Palestinian
Deadlock

Virginia Tilley

The University of Michigan Press
Ann Arbor

Copyright © by the University of Michigan 2005
All rights reserved
Published in the United States of America by
The University of Michigan Press
Manufactured in the United States of America
© Printed on acid-free paper

2008 2007 2006 2005 4 3 2 1

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored
in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or
by any means, electronic, mechanical, or otherwise,
without the written permission of the publisher.

A CIP catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Tilley, Virginia.

The one-state solution : a breakthrough for peace in
the Israeli-Palestinian deadlock / Virginia Tilley.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-472-11513-8 (cloth : alk. paper)

I. Arab-Israeli conflict—Peace. I. Title.

DS119.7.T495 2005

956.9405'4—dc22

2005002497

TO THE PALESTINIAN & JEWISH PEOPLES

“Zion shall be redeemed through justice,
and her returning ones by doing what is right.”

—*Isaiah 1:27*

Contents

<i>Illustrations</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
1. FACING FACTS	1
2. THE IMMOVABLE OBJECT The Settlement Grid	19
3. PASSIONATE INTENSITIES or Why No Other Plan Will Work	51
4. LACKING ALL CONVICTION The Key External Actors	89
5. TRACING THE INNER THREADS OF ZIONISM	131
6. THE ONE-STATE SOLUTION The Expanding Debate	183
<i>Appendix A</i>	235
<i>Appendix B</i>	241
<i>Notes</i>	243
<i>Bibliography</i>	261
<i>Index</i>	269

Illustrations

MAPS

1. The future Palestinian state as suggested by route of Israel's "security fence" and the settlement grid 2
2. Future Palestinian sovereignty in the West Bank as suggested by Ariel Sharon's "unilateral disengagement" policy 4
3. Expanded Jerusalem 24
4. Israeli Settlements and Outposts in the West Bank, 1999 26
5. The Ariel Settlement Bloc with the "Separation Barrier" 27
6. Palestinian land left coherent by the Oslo II Accord of 1995 28
7. The Gaza Strip 31
8. The Rehan Settlement Bloc 38
9. Actual and Projected Route of Israel's "Security" Wall in the West Bank 66
10. West Bank Aquifers 67
11. UN Partition Plan for Palestine, 1947 78
12. Palestinian Sovereign Areas according to the Barak/Sharon Proposals, 2001 82
13. Projection of Final Status Agreement proposed by Israel, Camp David, May 2000 82

14. Israeli Proposal for Final Status Map, December 2000	83
15. Taba Agreement, January 2001	83
16. Territories occupied by Israel after the 1967 War	95

Illustrations

x

FIGURE

1. Advertisement promoting industry in the West Bank, appearing in <i>Homecoming</i> (1983), a promotional magazine for Jewish settlement and development in “Judea and Samaria”	44
--	----

Acknowledgments

I owe innumerable intellectual debts for the contents of this book—written nineteen years after I first went to Jerusalem in 1985 (then entirely naive), on a study-abroad program from Antioch College. While living nearly two years in the Old City of Jerusalem, El Bireh, Ramallah, and Bir Zeit and working with Israeli and Palestinian peace groups especially in East and West Jerusalem, I had the privilege of working with the most courageous people I have ever known. The capacity of Jewish Israelis, Arab Israelis, Palestinians, and a cluster of foreigners to sustain a moral compass through the most daunting of conditions was a lasting inspiration and left me with a sense of moral obligation to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, which I hope this book can partly indicate to these people even if it digresses from their views. I could not mention any of them individually without slighting others; a generic thanks is all I can offer.

My capacity to build on that experience in more theoretical ways traces, first, to Professor Hassan Nejad at Antioch College and, later, to graduate study with the outstanding faculty at the Center for Contemporary Arab Studies at Georgetown University. Doctoral work on ethnic conflict with Crawford Young and other faculty at the University of Wisconsin-Madison also infuses this work in ways that they will perceive and that I hope will meet with their approval. In writing much of this book, I also often recalled my work in Washington, D.C., with the remarkable Joseph Schechla, whose insights still hover between many of these lines. My contact through him to Tom and Sally Mallison, Elmer Berger, Roselle Tekiner, and others from the

International Organization for the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination was a rare privilege and lastingly strengthened my work in the field.

Returning in spring 2004 to the subject of Israel-Palestine, after years of comparative work in Latin America, I relied heavily on the excellent primary documentation now available online from such projects as the Foundation for Middle East Peace and the Jewish Virtual Library. My analysis was also freshly filled out by conversations and correspondence with Avi Shlaim at Oxford University (whose particular generosity is gratefully remembered), Rabbi David Goldberg in London, and ‘Azmi Bishara during one important evening. Steven Friedman at the Center for Policy Studies in Johannesburg offered key early insights and ongoing feedback that greatly assisted my analysis. Tony Judt and an anonymous reviewer for the University of Michigan Press provided crucial feedback and immeasurable help in identifying slips and weaknesses in my argument. All these people, each working in a different realm, consistently engaged difficult questions about Israel-Palestine with an exemplary fairness, professionalism, and personal integrity that encouraged my optimism for broader discussions among international networks similarly anxious about the present course of events. These people should not, however, be assumed to agree with me on all points presented here, and certainly no errors here trace to them. Other people who helped with this book, but who are under such political difficulty as to ask anonymity, are quietly appreciated and I hope their role will someday be known.

Finally, for their patient reading of drafts and their very thoughtful comments, which were of immeasurable value in strengthening my discussion in this book, I am grateful to my dear friends Patricia Billings, Meredith Moodie and, not least, my extraordinary editor at the University of Michigan Press, Jim Reische. In their kind assistance, all these friends reflected back to me a sense of their collective care for the project. I hope this book fulfills their expectations and offers some return for their guidance and encouragement.