

Their Sisters' Keepers: Women's Prison Reform in America, 1830-1930
Estelle B. Freedman
<http://www.press.umich.edu/titleDetailDesc.do?id=12633>
The University of Michigan, 2009.

Their Sisters' Keepers

Their Sisters' Keepers

Women's Prison Reform in America, 1830–1930

Estelle B. Freedman

The University of Michigan Press
Ann Arbor

First paperbound edition 1984
Copyright © by the University of Michigan 1981
All rights reserved
Published in the United States of America by
The University of Michigan Press
Manufactured in the United States of America
♻️ Printed on acid-free paper

2000 1999 1998 1997 7 6 5 4

No part of this publication may be reproduced,
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form
or by any means, electronic, mechanical, or otherwise,
without the written permission of the publisher.

Estelle B. Freedman is a Hamilton Prize winner for 1978. The Alice and Edith Hamilton Prize is named for two outstanding women scholars: Alice Hamilton (educated at the University of Michigan Medical School), a pioneer in environmental medicine; and her sister Edith Hamilton, the renowned classicist. The Hamilton Prize competition is supported by the University of Michigan and by private donors.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Freedman, Estelle B. 1947–
Their sisters' keepers.

(Women and culture series)

Based on the author's thesis, Columbia University.

Bibliography: p.

Includes index.

1. Reformatories for women—United States—History.
2. Prison reformers—United States—History. I. Title.
II. Series.

HV9466.F73 365'.43'0973 80–24918

ISBN 0–472–10008–4

ISBN 0–472–08052–0 (pbk.)

To the memory of my grandparents

Acknowledgments

I began to study the history of women's prison reform in 1972, when women's history was not yet included in the graduate curriculum. No one I talked with then knew why separate women's prisons had originated in the nineteenth century, and I decided to find an answer. Thanks to the growth of women's history, and in turn to the feminist movement, I have been able to ask many more questions about this topic and to begin to answer them in this book. I am grateful to the students and teachers of women's history for making this study possible, and to the Horace H. Rackham Graduate School of the University of Michigan for recognizing the importance of women's studies by establishing the Hamilton Prize.

I have many friends and co-workers to thank for their help. First, I would like to acknowledge the research funds provided by the departments of history at Stanford and Princeton universities and the Criminal Justice Program at Princeton. The librarians at these universities, and at the Schlesinger Library at Radcliffe College; the Massachusetts Correctional Institution at Framingham; the archives of Earlham College in Richmond, Indiana; the state libraries of Indiana, Massachusetts, and New York; and the volunteers' office at the New York Reformatory for Women at Bedford Hills all helped me locate obscure sources. My dissertation advisor at Columbia University, Kenneth T. Jackson, offered both encouragement and useful criticism from the outset of the project. I benefited greatly from comments on my thesis by John D'Emilio, Michael Hindus, Louise Knauer, Judith Johnston, Elaine Tyler May, Rosalind Rosenberg, and Nancy Weiss, and from close readings of the revised manuscript by David Kennedy, Carolyn Lougee, Elizabeth Pleck, Carroll Smith-Rosenberg, Louise Tilly, and the anonymous referees on the Hamilton Prize committee. In addition, criticisms of individual chapters by Carl Degler, Irene Diamond, Yolaida Durán, Mary Felstiner, Gary Sue Goodman, Gail Hershatter, Paul Robinson, and Michelle Rosaldo influenced my thinking and my writing. I am especially grateful to John D'Emilio for suggesting improvements on successive drafts of each chapter, for typ-

viii / ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

ing the manuscript speedily and skillfully, and for providing consistent moral support. I appreciate as well the careful research assistance and friendships of Yolaida Durán, Cindy Fritz, Sue Macy, and Joanne Meyerowitz. While each of these individuals helped improve the book, I am solely responsible for its final contents.

Members of several women's groups offered intellectual stimulation and personal support as I researched and wrote this study. The Center for Research on Women group at Stanford helped me clarify my ideas about women's prison reform. Feminist study groups in Princeton, Palo Alto, and San Francisco have contributed to my personal and political appreciation of the issues raised by this topic. I want to thank all of my friends in the East and in California, my parents, and my sister and her family for both their interest in my work and the diversions they provided from it over the years. Above all, my best friends, Ilene Levitt and John D'Emilio, deserve special credit for helping me in every way they could.

Contents

Introduction 1

Part 1: The Origins of Women's Prison Reform

- Chapter 1.* The Problem of the Woman Prisoner, 1820–70 7
- Chapter 2.* “The Helping Hand”: The Origins and Ideas of Women’s Prison Reform, 1840–1900 22
- Chapter 3.* Feminist or Feminine? The Establishment of Separate Women’s Prisons, 1870–1900 46

Part 2: The Institutional Compromise: Women's Prisons in Indiana, Massachusetts, and New York, 1870–1910

- Chapter 4.* The Women’s Prison Environment 67
- Chapter 5.* Domesticity, Discipline, and Prisoners’ Response: Retraining Women in Prison 89

Part 3: The Progressive Approach, 1900–1920

- Chapter 6.* The New Criminology of Women, 1900–1920 109
- Chapter 7.* The Limits of Progressive Penology, 1900–1920 126
- Chapter 8.* The Legacy of Women’s Prison Reform: An Epilogue and Evaluation 143

Appendices 159

Abbreviations 179

Notes 181

Bibliography 227

Index 237

Illustrations *following page 118*