

# **Listening to Popular Music**

Or, How I Learned to Stop

Worrying and Love

Led Zeppelin

## TRACKING POP

SERIES EDITORS: LORI BURNS, JOHN COVACH, AND ALBIN ZAK

In one form or another, the sonic influence of popular music has permeated cultural activities and perception on a global scale. Interdisciplinary in nature, *Tracking Pop* is intended as a rich exploration of pop music and its cultural situation. In addition to providing much-needed resources for the ever-increasing number of students and scholars working in the field of popular culture, the books in this series will appeal to general readers and music lovers, for whom pop has provided the soundtrack of their lives over the past fifty years.

**Listening to Popular Music**  
Or, How I Learned to Stop  
Worrying and Love  
Led Zeppelin

**Theodore Gracyk**

**The University of Michigan Press** Ann Arbor

Copyright © by the University of Michigan 2007  
All rights reserved  
Published in the United States of America by  
The University of Michigan Press  
Manufactured in the United States of America  
© Printed on acid-free paper

2010 2009 2008 2007 4 3 2 1

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system,  
or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, or otherwise,  
without the written permission of the publisher.

*A CIP catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.*

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Gracyk, Theodore.

Listening to popular music, or how I learned to stop worrying and  
love Led Zeppelin / Theodore Gracyk.

p. cm. — (Tracking pop)

Includes bibliographical references (p. ) and index.

ISBN-13: 978-0-472-09983-2 (cloth : alk. paper)

ISBN-10: 0-472-09983-3 (cloth : alk. paper)

ISBN-13: 978-0-472-06983-5 (pbk. : alk. paper)

ISBN-10: 0-472-06983-7 (pbk. : alk. paper)

1. Popular music—Philosophy and aesthetics. I. Title. II. Title:  
How I learned to stop worrying and love Led Zeppelin.

ML3877.G72 2007

781.64'117—dc22

2006032063

**For my parents, who put up with a lot of music they hated**

Popularity is not, as many seem to think, a specialty of strings of obvious phrases built on a simple rhythm. That music is *popular* which arrests people's attention and, when heard again, compels their recognition; not that whose highest success is momentarily to tickle their ears.

—Edmund Gurney, 1880

# Contents

Acknowledgments	xi
Introduction: Aesthetics and Popular Music	I

## Part One. Aesthetics without Elitism

<b>1. Separating Aesthetics from Art</b>	<b>11</b>
The Question of “Art”	11
<i>Pet Sounds</i> and Traditional Criteria for Art Status	15
The Problem Generalized	24
Pierre Bourdieu and the Sociological Critique	28
Everyday Aesthetics	35
<b>2. Clearing Space for Aesthetic Value</b>	<b>41</b>
Interpreting Songs	41
The Social Relevance Thesis	46
Dutch Teens and the Excess Problem	51
The Interaction of Politics and Aesthetics	59
The Case of “Bohemian Rhapsody”	63
Pragmatic Considerations	67
<b>3. Aesthetic Principles and Aesthetic Properties</b>	<b>73</b>
Unprincipled Evaluations	73
Listening to the Blues	77
Four Challenges to Aesthetic Principles	87
Musical Categories and Ideal Critics	94

**Part Two. The Aesthetic Value of the Popular**

- 4. Appreciating, Valuing, and Evaluating Music** 103
- Distinguishing among Objects of Evaluation 103
  - Appreciating and Evaluating 109
  - Cognitive Value and Appreciation 114
  - Functionality and Value 118
  - The Value of a Taste for a Musical Style 123
  - Value as Choice and as Importance 127
- 5. The Ideas of Hearing and Listening** 134
- A Short History of the Distinction 135
  - Denigrating the Popular 139
  - Is Listening an Exclusive Activity? 143
  - Listening to David Bowie 146

**Part Three. Listening as Engagement with Symbols**

- 6. Music's Worldly Uses** 153
- Traditional Elitism 154
  - Music as Thought 157
  - Unexpected Communities 167
  - The Politics of Noise 172
- 7. Taste and Musical Identity** 176
- Music in Identities 178
  - Adolescence and the Problem of Self-Identity 181
  - Imagining Music and Imagining Self 184
- Conclusion 191
- Notes 195
- Selected Bibliography 225
- Index 231



## Acknowledgments

I would like to thank John Covach for his immediate support for this project when I mentioned it to him. Had he been less enthusiastic, this would have been another one of those projects that sits for years on my hard drive, half-finished.

This book also reflects the kind help, support, and advice of a number of friends and scholars. I would particularly like to extend my thanks to Philip Alperson, Ralph von Appen, Bruce Baugh, Wayne Bowman, Lee B. Brown, Magdalene Chalikia, Stephen Davies, David Goldblatt, Athena Gracyk, Kathleen Higgins, Bill Irwin, Andrew Kania, Justin London, Renée Lorraine, Elizabeth Nawrot, Alex Neill, Bennett Reimer, Carlos Rodriguez, Joel Rudinow, and Robert Stecker. In most cases, our conversations and exchanges directed my thinking. (It's remarkable how the simplest exchange will sometimes redirect an argument in an entirely fresh direction.) Some directed me to valuable research sources. Some gave me detailed feedback on parts of the manuscript. Others invited me to write essays for their own projects, and those essays contributed to several of the chapters.

I very gratefully acknowledge and thank the three anonymous readers whom the University of Michigan Press secured to read and comment on the book as it developed. Their advice, together with that of Chris Hebert, was enormously useful to me.

I thank the editors and publishers who have kindly granted permission to reprint work appearing, in revised form, in this book. The original publication information is as follows.

“Valuing and Evaluating Popular Music,” *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 57, no.2 (Spring 1999): 205–20; “Popular Music: The Very Idea of Listening to It,” is from *Bridging the Gap: Popular Music and Music Education*, edited by Carlos Xavier Rodriguez. Copyright © 2004 by MENC—The

National Association for Music Education, 2004. Reprinted by permission; “Music’s Worldly Uses,” in *Arguing About Art: Contemporary Philosophical Debates*, ed. Alex Neil and Aaron Ridley, 2nd ed. (London: Routledge, 2002), 135–48; “Does Everyone Have a Musical Identity? Reflections on *Musical Identities*,” *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* 3, no. 1 (May 2004), <http://www.siue.edu/MUSIC/ACTPAPERS/v3/Gracyko4.pdf>.

Finally, I thank Minnesota State University Moorhead for providing one semester of sabbatical leave, during which I completed my first version of the manuscript.