

Ellery's Protest

ELLERY'S PROTEST

How One Young Man Defied
Tradition & Sparked the Battle
over School Prayer

STEPHEN D. SOLOMON

Copyright © 2007 by Stephen D. Solomon
All rights reserved
Published in the United States of America by
The University of Michigan Press
Manufactured in the United States of America
© Printed on acid-free paper

2010 2009 2008 2007 4 3 2 1

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored
in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form
or by any means, electronic, mechanical, or otherwise,
without the written permission of the publisher.

A CIP catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Solomon, Stephen D.

Ellery's protest : how one young man defied tradition and sparked
the battle over school prayer / Stephen D. Solomon.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN-13: 978-0-472-10837-4 (cloth : alk. paper)

ISBN-10: 0-472-10837-9 (cloth : alk. paper)

1. Abington Township School District (Abington, Pa.)—Trials,
litigation, etc.
2. Schempp, Edward—Trials, litigation, etc.
3. Prayer in the public schools—Law and legislation—United States.
4. Church and state—United States. I. Title.

KF228.A25S65 2007

344.73'0796—dc22

2006102220

For Sarah and Brian

I think that tradition is not to be scoffed at, but let me say this very candidly: I think it is the final arrogance to talk constantly about the religious tradition in this country and equate it with this Bible. Sure, religious tradition. Whose religious tradition? It isn't any part of the religious tradition of a substantial number of Americans. . . . And it's just, to me, a little bit easy and I say arrogant to keep talking about our religious tradition. It suggests that the public schools, at least of Pennsylvania, are a kind of Protestant institution to which others are cordially invited.

—Henry W. Sawyer III, argument before the
U.S. Supreme Court, February 28, 1963

Acknowledgments

Although research and writing require countless hours of working alone, the process of taking a book from idea to published work involves many helpful people. I am indebted to all those who assisted me at every stage of this endeavor.

Special thanks go to Ellery Schempp, who spent many hours recalling for me the circumstances of his protest against Bible reading and recitation of the Lord's Prayer at Abington High School. Ellery made available his family papers, which contained, among other things, correspondence, clippings, and photographs. I also conducted valuable interviews with Ellery's siblings, Donna and Roger, as well as his parents, Sidney and Edward. I am grateful as well to many other people who shared their recollections of the case and of the times in which it was litigated.

I worked in some of the nation's finest research libraries and greatly benefited from their comprehensive collections of letters, manuscripts, and legal materials. To the extent that this book contains original scholarship, thanks go to these libraries for maintaining such valuable repositories of American history and to their knowledgeable and helpful staffs. At the Manuscript Division of the Library of Congress in Washington, D.C., I studied the files of many of the justices who decided the *Schempp*, *Murray*, and *Engel* cases. The National Archives in Philadelphia had case files from the *Schempp* trial. The Syracuse University Library made available its extensive files from the Leo Pfeffer Papers. The Tarleton Law Library at the University of Texas School of Law provided access to

its collection on Justice Tom C. Clark, and the library deserves special commendation for making available online an extensive array of Justice Clark's drafts and many court documents relating to the *Schempp* case. The Princeton University Library welcomed me to research the papers of Justice John Marshall Harlan as well as the American Civil Liberties Union Archives. Temple University's Urban Archives provided access to the files of the Philadelphia ACLU chapter as well as the papers of Spencer Coxe. The ACLU's Philadelphia chapter gave me permission to quote from ACLU materials. The American Jewish Historical Society, in New York, had useful information on Shad Polier. The Old York Road Historical Society in Jenkintown, Pennsylvania, gave me access to historical material about Abington Township and the surrounding area. Thanks also go to Hugo L. Black, Jr., son of the justice of the same name, who gave me permission to look through the justice's files. Finally, I thank the staff at New York University's Elmer Holmes Bobst Library, where I found many books that proved important in my research.

Robert M. O'Neil, professor of law at the University of Virginia School of Law and director of the Thomas Jefferson Center for the Protection of Free Expression, gave graciously of his time and expertise. Professor O'Neil, who, as a clerk to Justice William J. Brennan, Jr., worked on the *Schempp* case in 1962–63, provided recollections of the case as well as scholarly critiques of my work at several important junctures in the creation of the manuscript.

Special thanks go to Jim Reische, my editor at the University of Michigan Press, and to Phil Pochoda, the editorial director. Both saw value in this work and gave me encouragement and invaluable guidance along the way. I am indebted to Kevin Rennells, senior copyediting coordinator, and to Jill Butler Wilson, both of whose careful editing improved my writing. Deborah Patton deserves my appreciation for her valuable work in indexing the book. My thanks go also to many people at the University of Michigan Press whose work behind the scenes was so important to the development and production of this book.

A number of student research assistants helped me find important documents and run down needed details. They include Lisa Miller, Esta Tanenbaum, Jonathan Nabavi, Sachin Gandhi, Michael Schimel, and Brian Solomon. I appreciate their diligence and dedication in adding to the depth of this book.

Finally, I owe so much to Debbi Dunn Solomon, my most enthusiastic supporter. In so many ways, she made it possible for me to write this book.

Contents

1. Ellery's Protest	I
2. The Making of a Rebel	8
3. Byse Breaks the Deadlock	31
4. The Sage and the Upstart	54
5. The Colonists Unite Church and State	70
6. How Religious Diversity Changed America	80
7. Diversity Forces Religion from the Schools	96
8. Excessive Religious Zeal	115
9. "Mr. Schempp, Do You Believe in the Divinity of Christ?"	132
10. Is the Bible Sectarian?	152
11. Why Not Recite the Navaho Invocation to Beauty?	172
12. The Race to the Supreme Court	189
13. "Colored by Our Own Experiences"	197
14. Passion Plays for All	210
15. Back to Judge Biggs	229
16. New York's "Clay-Footed Pigeon"	243
17. Fifty-one Buddhist Children	264
18. In Chambers	281
19. Days of Defiance	307
20. Does <i>Schempp</i> Have a Future?	324
Epilogue	347
Notes	349
Index	383

Illustrations following page 178