Contents

Preface xvi
1. Main Sources and Method Followed in This Study xvii
2. Other Primary Sources and Secondary Literature Used in This Study xix
3. Content, Goals, and Limitations of This Study xx

PART 1. ARISTARCHUS: CONTEXTS AND SOURCES

1.1. Aristarchus: Life, Sources, and Selection of Fragments 3
   1. Aristarchus at Alexandria 3
   2. The Aristarchean Tradition and the *Venetus A* 6
   3. The *Scholia Maiora* to the *Iliad* and Erbse’s Edition 11
   4. Aristarchus in the Scholia 14
      4.1. Aristonicus at Work 15
      4.2. Didymus at Work 18
      4.3. Aristonicus versus Didymus 23
   5. Selecting Aristarchus’ Fragments for This Study 26
   6. Words and Content in Aristarchus’ Fragments 27

1.2. Aristarchus on Homer: Monographs, Editions, and Commentaries 30
   1. Homeric Monographs 31
   2. Editions (*Ekdoseis*) and Commentaries (*Hypomnemata*): The Evidence 35
      2.1. Ammonius and the Homeric *Ekdosis* of Aristarchus 36
      2.2. *Ekdoseis* and *Hypomnemata*: Different Reconstructions 38
   3. The Impact of Aristarchus’ Recension on the Text of Homer 41
   4. *Ekdoseis* and *Hypomnemata*: Some Tentative Conclusions 44

PART 2. ARISTARCHUS AT WORK

2.1. Critical Signs: The Bridge between Edition and Commentary 49
   1. The Critical Signs (*σημεία*) Used by the Alexandrians 49
# Contents

2. *Ekdosis, Hypomnema*, and Critical Signs 52  
3. Homeric *Hypomnemata* on Papyrus and Critical Signs 56  
4. Homeric *Ekdoseis* on Papyrus and Critical Signs 59  
5. Conclusions 62  

2.2. Aristarchus and Manuscript Evidence 63  
1. Evidence from Didymus 65  
2. Evidence from Aristonicus 72  
3. Conclusions 73  

2.3. Paraphrase: A Ubiquitous Interpretative Tool 76  
1. Aristarchus' Direct Quotations: Lecturing with Paraphrases 78  
2. Close and Loose Paraphrases 81  
3. Close Paraphrases: Homer ‘Translated’ into Koine 82  
4. Loose Paraphrases: Discussing Homeric Content 85  
5. Other Uses of Paraphrases 87  
6. Conclusions 89  

**Part 3. The Six Parts of Grammar**

3.0. The Six Parts of Grammar 93  
3.1. Reading Aloud: The Interpretative Effort of Reading 101  
1. The Philologist and the Manuscript 102  
2. Reading according to the Right Vowel Quantities 103  
3. A Question of Division: Interpreting the *Scriptio Continua* 105  
4.1. Accents and Analogy 110  
4.2. Accents and Homographs 111  
4.3. Accents, *Scriptio Continua*, and Syntax 113  
5. Between Reading and Semantics: Choosing the Breathing 116  
6. Reading Aloud: Syntax and Punctuation 117  
7. Posidonius, the ‘Reader’ of Aristarchus 119  
8. Conclusions 122  

3.2. A. Interpretation of Poetic Tropes: Decoding Homer's Style and Figurative Language 124  
1. Tropes and Figures 125  
2. Criteria Adopted in This Chapter 126  
3. Metaphor (μεταφορά) 129  
4. Simile (εἰκών, ὁμοίωσις, παραβολή) 133  
5. Allegory (ἀλληγορία) 138  
6. Synecdoche (τὸ ὅλον ἀπὸ μέρους) 142  
7. Litotes and Irony (ἐκ τοῦ ἐναντίου τὸ ἐναντίον) 144  
8. Antithesis (ἀντικειμένως) 147  
9. ‘Side by Side’ Construction (παραλλήλως, ἐκ παραλλήλου) 148
The Best of the Grammarians: Aristarchus of Samothrace on the Iliad
Francesca Schironi
https://www.press.umich.edu/8769399/best_of_the_grammarians
University of Michigan Press, 2018

CONTENTS ix

10. Resumption (ἐπανάληψις) 150
11. Preeminence (ἐξοχή) 153
12. Reverse Order (πρὸς τὸ δεύτερον πρότερον) 154
13. Parallel Order (πρὸς τὸ πρότερον πρότερον) 157
14. Hyperbaton (ὑπερβατόν) 159
15. Syllepsis (σύλληψις) 161
16. Hyperbole (ὑπερβολή) 163
17. Amplification (αὔξησις) and Suggestiveness (ἔμφασις) 164
18. Conclusions 167

3.2.B. Interpretation of Poetic Figures: Decoding Homer’s Syntax 171
1. Superfluous Parts of Speech (περισσεύειν, περισσός) 175
1.1. Superfluous Prepositions 176
1.2. Superfluous Particles and Conjunctions 176
1.3. Superfluous Words Are ‘Redundant’ (παρέλκειν) 179
2. Ellipsis (ἐλλείπειν, ἔλλειψις) 180
2.1. Ellipsis of Articles 181
2.2. Ellipsis of Prepositions 182
3.1. Enallage of Articles 186
3.2. Enallage of Prepositions 188
3.3. Enallage of Case 190
3.4. Enallage of Case and Enallage, or Ellipsis, of Preposition 192
3.5. Other Enallages in Nominal Forms: Gender and Number 193
3.6. Enallage of Tense 195
3.7. Enallage of Mood 197
3.7.1. Ibycean Figure (Ἰβύκειον σχῆμα) 198
3.8. Other Enallages in Verbal Forms: Voice and Person 200
3.9. Enallages Involving Adjectives, Adverbs, Prepositions, and Particles 202
4. Figures concerning the Agreement of Subject and Predicate 203
4.1. Pindaric Figure (Πινδαρικὸν σχῆμα) 203
4.2. Plural Predicates with Neuter Plural Subjects 203
4.3. Alcmanic Figure (Ἀλκμανικὸν σχῆμα) 205
5. Concordantia ad Sensum (σχῆμα πρὸς τὸ νοητόν / πρὸς τὸ σημαινόμενον) 206
6. Ἀπὸ Κοινοῦ Construction (σχῆμα ἀπὸ κοινοῦ or κοινόν) 207
6.1. Ἀπὸ Κοινοῦ Constructions and Atheteseis 208
7. Syntactic Supplements (ἐξωθεῖν [προσ]ύπακουσιν/λαμβάνειν) 209
7.1. Syntactic Supplements (ἐξωθεῖν ἀκοουστέον) and Atheteseis 212
7.2. Other Figures Requiring Syntactic/Semantic Supplements 212
8. Conclusions 213
3.3.A. Explanation of Glossai: Diving into the Microcosm
of Homeric Vocabulary

1. Analyzing Homeric Vocabulary
   1.1. Homer as Exegete of Himself
   1.2. Glossai Clarified by the Context (σαφῶς ἐκ τῶν συμφραζομένων)
   1.3. Clarifying Homer without Homer

2. Homeric Vocabulary as a Self-Sufficient Microcosm
   2.1. Homeric Greek versus Koine
   2.2. Homeric Greek in Line with Koine
   2.3. Standard Meaning (κυρίως) versus Peculiar Meaning (οὐ κυρίως/ἰδίως)
   2.4. Homeric Words with a Specific Meaning (οὐ ψιλῶς)
   2.5. Sharp Distinctions in Homeric Vocabulary
   2.6. Polysemous Words in Homer
   2.7. Homeric Words with Both Active and Passive Meaning
   2.8. Words with a Meaning Arising ‘from the Consequence’ (ἐκ [τοῦ] παρεπομένου /παρακολουθοῦντος)
   2.9. Genus and Species
   2.10. Homeric Hapax Legomena
   2.11. Words Used Wrongly or according to Catachresis (καταχρηστικῶς)

3. Against the Glossographers’ One-for-One (ἓν ἀνθ’ ἑνός) Interpretation

4. Solving Problems through Homeric Vocabulary
   4.1. Solving Zetemata and Perceived Narrative Inconsistencies
   4.2. Solving Perceived Linguistic Inconsistencies
   4.3. Choice between Variants
   4.4. Atheteseis Due to Words Used οὐχ Ὁμηρικῶς

5. Conclusions

3.3.B. Explanation of Historiai: Characters, Customs, and Places of the Heroic World

1. ‘Who Is Who’ in the Iliad
   1.1. Homonymy: Same Name for Different Heroes
   1.2. Homonymy to ‘Save’ Homer’s Consistency
   1.3. Double Names: Same Hero with Different Names

2. The Heroic World
   2.1. The Society of the Iliad: Heroes, Kings, and Soldiers
   2.2. Social and Religious Rituals
   2.3. Meals, Food, and Dining Habits
   2.4. Clothes and Fashion
   2.5. Money and Writing
## Contents

2.6. The Dead and Their Rituals .................................................. 283  
2.7. Sports and Funeral Games .................................................. 284  
2.8. Horses and Chariots .......................................................... 287  
2.9. Weaponry  
  2.9.1. The Armor .............................................................. 288  
  2.9.2. The Shield ............................................................. 291  
  2.9.3. The *Zetema* of the Shield of Achilles ......................... 292  
  2.9.4. Helmets, Swords, and Other Weapons ......................... 294  
  2.9.5. Arming Scenes ....................................................... 295  
3. Homeric Geography and Ethnography ...................................... 297  
  3.1. Homonymy: Same Name for Different Places ..................... 298  
  3.2. Double Names: Same Place with Different Names ............... 299  
  3.3. Hellas and Hellenes ..................................................... 301  
  3.4. Troy and Troad ............................................................ 302  
  3.5. Mapping the Theater of War: The Monograph *On the Camp* 303  
    3.5.1. The Ships in the Achaean Camp ................................ 304  
    3.5.2. The Order of the Greek Contingents in the Camp .......... 305  
    3.5.3. The Battle at the Achaean Wall ................................ 308  
    3.5.4. The Battlefield in the Trojan Plain .......................... 314  
    3.5.5. The Gates of Troy ............................................... 315  
  3.6. The Catalog of the Ships ............................................... 316  
4. Homeric Cosmology .............................................................. 318  
  4.1. Oceanus .................................................................. 319  
  4.2. The Stars, the Sun, East, and West ................................. 320  
  4.3. North, South, and the *Oikoumene* ................................. 322  
  4.4. Air, Aether, Heaven, and Olympus .................................. 323  
5. Homeric Gods .................................................................. 329  
  5.2. The Gods’ Epithets ....................................................... 332  
6. The World of the Heroes and the World of Homer .................... 333  
7. Conclusions .................................................................. 335  

3.4. Discovery of Etymology: An Objective, Multipurpose Practice 340  
1. Etymological Strategies ....................................................... 342  
  1.1. Word Segmentation and Phonetic Changes ....................... 342  
  1.2. Sharing of Letters/Consonants (κοινωνία τῶν στοιχείων/  
       συμφώνων) ............................................................. 344  
  1.3. Reaching beyond Homer ................................................. 346  
2. Etymology: A Method ‘from Within’ ....................................... 349  
3. Etymology and Homeric Glossai ............................................ 352  
  3.1. Etymology and Words Used according to the  
       Standard Meaning (κυρίως) ......................................... 352  
  3.2. Against the Glossographers ............................................ 354
3.3. Homer and the Neoteroi 357
4. Etymology and Compounds 358
5. Etymology and Interspiration 361
6. Etymology and Variant Readings 363
7. Aristarchus’ Etymology versus Crates’ Etymology 365
8. Homer’s Etymologies 370
8.1. Figura Etymologica (παρετυμολογεῖ [ὁ ποιητής]) 371
8.2. Nomen Omen (ὄνοματοθετικὸς ὁ ποιητής) 373
9. Conclusions 374

3.5. Calculation of Analogy: A ‘Scientific’ Method Applied to the Text 377
1. Types of Analogical Proportions 378
2. Fragments with Aristarchus’ Analogies 381
3. The Criteria of Analogy 383
4. The Choice of Comparanda: Homer and Beyond 387
5. Semantic Analogy 391
6. The Function of Analogy 394
7. Analogy and Deductive Reasoning 399
8. Implied Analogies and ‘Rational Relationships’ among Forms 403
9. Herodian’s Analogy and Aristarchus’ Analogical Proportions 405
10. Conclusions 410

3.6.A. Judgment of Poems: Aristotle’s Lesson 413
1. Aristotle and Aristarchus 414
2. A Preliminary Assumption about Tragedy and Epos 416
3. Aristotelian Theory and Aristarchean Practice: Plot (μῦθος) 417
4. Aristotelian Theory and Aristarchean Practice: Characters (ἦθη) 426
5. Aristotelian Theory and Aristarchean Practice: Thought (διάνοια) 434
6. Aristotelian Theory and Aristarchean Practice: Diction (λέξις) 437
7. Conclusions 441

1. The ‘Invention’ of Athetesis 446
2. A General Rule for Athetesis 447
3. Aristarchus’ Atheteseis and Manuscript Evidence 448
4. Main Reasons to Suspect Lines 452
4.1. Internal Inconsistency and Contradictions 453
4.2. Unsuitable Lines 456
4.3. Unbelievability 461
4.4. Superfluous or Unnecessary Lines 463
4.5. Non-Homeric Language or Society 468
5. Additional Reasons to Suspect Lines 469
5.1. ‘Prosaic’ or ‘Cheap’ Composition 470
5.2. Tautologies 470
5.3. Repeated Lines 473
CONTENTS

6. Athetesis of Longer Passages 481
7. Why Should Some Lines Be Athetized? 484
  7.1. The Pernicious Work of the ‘Interpolators’ (διασκευασταί) 485
  7.2. Aristarchus and the ‘Interpolators’ (διασκευασταί) 486
8. Aristarchus’ Attempt to Recover the ‘Original’ Script 490
9. Conclusions 492

3.6.C. Judgment of Poems: The Art of ‘Saving’ the Homeric Text 497
1. Homer’s Formulaic Style 499
  1.1. Misuse (κατάχρησις) of Formulaic Lines 499
  1.2. Homer’s Epithets 502
    1.2.1. Generic Epithets (καθολικὰ/κοινὰ ἐπίθετα) and Nongeneric Ones 503
    1.2.2. Out-of-Place Epithets (ἀκαιρα ἐπίθετα) 507
    1.2.3. Epithets and Poetic License 508
2. Homer’s Poetic Persona 510
  2.1. The Poet’s Persona (ἐκ τοῦ ἰδίου/ποιητικοῦ προσώπου) and His Characters’ Persona (ἐκ τοῦ ἡρωϊκοῦ προσώπου) 510
  2.2. The Poet ‘Speaks Up’ (ἀναφωνεῖ [ὁ ποιητής]) 512
  2.3. The Poet Speaks in Anticipation (προαναφωνεῖ [ὁ ποιητής]) 514
  2.4. Homer’s Rhetorical Questions (and Answers) 515
  2.5. Homer’s Direct Addresses (ἀποστροφαί) 516
  2.6. Homer’s ‘Generic You’ (ὡς πρός τινα / ὡς πρός ύποκείμενον πρόσωπον) 517
3. Homer’s Narrative Technique 519
  3.1. Events Which Happened ‘Tacitly’ (κατὰ τὸ σιωπώμενον) 519
  3.2. Events by Conclusion (κατὰ συμπέρασμα) or in Summary (κεφαλαιωδῶς) 521
  3.3. Summaries with Details and Detailed Descriptions 523
  3.4. Completing the Audience’s Knowledge 525
  3.5. Handling of Plot and Time: Zielinski’s Law 527
  3.6. Switching between Narrative and Speech 532
4. Pathos and Feelings in Homer 532
5. Zetemata and Lyseis 535
6. Aristarchus’ ‘Judgment’ (κρίσις) of Homeric Mistakes 540
7. Conclusions 542

PART 4. ARISTARCHUS AND HIS COLLEAGUES

4. Aristarchus and His Colleagues: Zenodotus, Aristophanes, and Others 547
  1. Aristarchus and Zenodotus 548
    1.1. Sources 548
    1.2. Zenodotus, ὁ οὖχ Ὄμηρικός 551
The Best of the Grammarians: Aristarchus of Samothrace on the Iliad
Francesca Schironi
https://www.press.umich.edu/8769399/best_of_the_grammarians
University of Michigan Press, 2018

xiv contents

1.2.1. Zenodotus and Homeric Vocabulary 551
1.2.2. Zenodotus, Homeric Morphology, and Syntax 553
1.2.3. Zenodotus, Homeric Style, and the Heroic World 555
1.3. Zenodotus, the Anti-Aristotelian
  1.3.1. ‘Unbelievable’ and ‘Contradictory’ Textual Choices 557
  1.3.2. Unfitting Characters and Thoughts 558
  1.3.3. Athetesis (or Deletion) of ‘Necessary’ Lines 560
1.4. Zenodotus, a Careless Reader 561
1.5. Aristarchus on Zenodotus: An Uneasy Relationship
  1.5.1. An Obsession Called Zenodotus? 566
  1.5.2. Aristarchus’ Attempt at Objectivity 569
1.6. Zenodotus’ Text: Deletions, Atheteseis, and Additions 572
1.7. Is Zenodotus Really the One to Blame? 575

2. Aristarchus and Aristophanes of Byzantium 578
3. Aristarchus and Other Alexandrian Scholars 582
4. Aristarchus and Crates of Mallos 583
  4.1. Aristarchus’ Knowledge of Crates’ Work (and Vice Versa) 584
  4.2. The Aristonicus Scholia Discussing Crates’ Views 587
5. Conclusions 591

PART 5. ARISTARCHUS’ HOMER

5.1. Aristarchus and Homeric Language 597
  1. A Synchronic or Diachronic Perspective? 598
    1.1. Homer versus Us: The Otherness of Homeric Diction 599
    1.2. Some Diachronic Clues 599
  2. Aristarchus and Homeric Dialectal Nuances 601
    2.1. Ionic
      2.1.1. η instead of α and Ionic Shortenings 602
      2.1.2. Other Ionic Features: Omission of Articles, Morphology, and Aspiration 604
    2.2. Attic
      2.2.1. The Dual 607
      2.2.2. The Dual in the Embassy to Achilles in Book 9 608
    2.3. Aeolic 612
    2.4. Doric 615
  3. Scriptio Continua and Dialectal Solutions 616
  4. Conclusions 620
5.2. The ‘Homeric Question’ 623
  1. The Poet Is the Same (ὁ αὐτὸς ἄρα ποιητής) 624
  2. The Polemics with the Chorizontes 627
CONTENTS

2.1. Who Were the Chorizontes? 627
2.2. Fighting the Chorizontes 628
2.3. Some Weaker Arguments against the Chorizontes 633
3. Clarifying the Odyssey from the Iliad (and Vice Versa) 639
   3.1. Linguistic and Stylistic Parallels 639
   3.2. Solving Zetemata with the Help of the Other Poem 642
   3.3. Atheteseis between the Iliad and the Odyssey 644
4. Conclusions 649
5.3. Homer and the Neoteroi 652
1. Homer versus the Neoteroi: Language 653
2. Homer versus the Neoteroi: Geography 657
3. Homer versus the Neoteroi: Myths 661
   3.1. Myths and Characters of the Trojan War 661
      3.1.1. The Origin of the Trojan War and Its Beginnings 662
      3.1.2. Achilles and His Family 667
      3.1.3. Ajax the Great 670
   3.2. Other Myths Where Homer Is Different from the Neoteroi 671
      3.2.1. Atreus and His Family 671
      3.2.2. Helen and Theseus 672
      3.2.3. Sarpedon and His Family 672
      3.2.4. Niobe 674
      3.2.5. Heracles and Oedipus 677
   3.3. Neoteric Narratives Inspired by Homer 679
3.4. They Got It Wrong: When the Neoteric Inspiration Is Flawed 681
   3.4.1. Misunderstanding of Homeric Scenes and Images 681
   3.4.2. Misunderstanding of Homeric Language 684
4. Homer versus the Neoteroi: Gods 687
   4.1. The Divine World 687
   4.2. Enyalius and Paean 688
   4.3. The Aegis 693
5. Homer versus Hesiod 695
   5.1. Clarifying Homer from Hesiod 695
   5.2. Hesiod Is Not Homer: The Hesiodic Otherness 697
   5.3. He Got It Wrong: Hesiod Misreads Homer 699
   5.4. Aristarchus on the Age of Hesiod (πρὸς τὰ περὶ ἡλικίας Ἡσιόδου) 702
6. Aristarchus and the Cycle 703
7. Conclusions 705
5.4. Aristarchus and Homeric Characters 709
   1. Achilles 710
   2. Agamemnon 717
3. Ajax 718
4. Odysseus 720
5. Hector 721
6. Priam 725
7. Andromache 726
8. Conclusions 728

6. Conclusions 733
1. Aristarchus in Context 734
2. Aristarchus’ Assumptions 735
   2.1. Assumption 1: Homer Was a Flawless Poet 736
   2.2. Assumption 2: Homer Was Internally Self-Consistent 736
   2.3. Assumption 3: Homer Was the Sole Author of Both the Iliad and the Odyssey 737
3. Aristarchus’ Methodological Rules 738
   3.1. Rule 1: To Read the Text Attentively 738
   3.2. Rule 2: To Make Use of Contextual Information 739
   3.3. Rule 3: To Have a Full Knowledge of the Homeric Poems 740
   3.4. Rule 4: To Consider the Homeric Poems as a Self-Sufficient Microcosm 740
4. Aristarchus’ Assumptions and Rules at Work 741
5. Aristarchus and Aristotle 742
6. Aristarchus and Crates, Grammatikoi and Kritikoi 744
7. Aristarchus and Hellenistic Science 749
8. Aristarchus the Empiricist 753
9. Some Problems in Aristarchus’ Method 756
10. Aristarchus’ Legacy 759

Technical Terms Often Used in This Book 763

Bibliography 765

Index I: General Index 803

Index II: Index of Greek Technical Terms Connected with Aristarchus’ Exegesis 839

Index III: Index of the Homeric Words Commented Upon by Aristarchus 849

Index IV: Index of the Homeric Scholia 857

Index V: Index of Other Ancient Sources 897